

Quasinormal Modes, Quantized Black Holes, and Correspondence Principle

I.B. Khriplovich¹

Budker Institute of Nuclear Physics
630090 Novosibirsk, Russia,
and Novosibirsk University

Abstract

Contrary to the wide-spread belief, the correspondence principle does not dictate any relation between the asymptotics of quasinormal modes and the spectrum of quantized black holes. Moreover, this belief is in conflict with simple physical arguments.

The quasinormal modes (QNM) are the solutions of the homogeneous wave equation in the gravitational field of a black hole with the boundary conditions corresponding to outgoing waves at spatial infinity and incoming waves at the horizon. Two boundary conditions make the frequency spectrum ω_n of QNMs, so-called ringing frequencies, discrete. Of course, the solutions for QNMs are not finite everywhere. We discuss here the gravitational perturbations of the Schwarzschild black hole.

The calculation of $\text{Im } \omega_n$ for $n \gg 1$ in the semiclassical approximation reduces to a relatively simple exercise in complex plane, with the result

$$M \text{Im } \omega_n = -\frac{1}{4} \left(n + \frac{1}{2} \right) \quad (1)$$

(here M is the black hole mass; the gravitational constant k and the velocity of light c are put to unity). However the corresponding problem for $\text{Re } \omega_n$ turned out much more difficult. This asymptotics was found initially in Refs. [1–3] by numerical methods:

$$M \text{Re } \omega_n = 0.0437123, \quad n \gg 1. \quad (2)$$

Then a curious observation was made in Ref. [4]: the result (2) can be presented as

$$M \text{Re } \omega_n = \frac{\ln 3}{8\pi}, \quad (3)$$

or

$$\text{Re } \omega_n = \frac{\ln 3}{8\pi M} = T_H \ln 3, \quad (4)$$

where T_H is the Hawking temperature. Expression (3) for the asymptotics of $\text{Re } \omega_n$ was afterwards derived in Refs.[5, 6] analytically.

¹khriplovich@inp.nsk.su

Certainly, the investigations of ringing frequencies for Schwarzschild black holes, as well as for Reissner-Nordström and Kerr ones, are of a real interest by themselves.

Meanwhile, it was suggested in Ref. [4] that the asymptotic value (3) for $\text{Re}\omega_n$ of the gravitational perturbation is of crucial importance for the quantization of Schwarzschild black holes. The idea has become quite popular and attempts are made to apply it to the quantization not only of Schwarzschild black holes, but of charged and rotating ones as well. There are scores of papers on the subject, and their list is too lengthy to be presented in this short note.

These attempts, starting with Ref. [4], appeal essentially to the correspondence principle quoted in Ref. [4] (with reference to [7]) as follows: “transition frequencies at large quantum numbers should equal classical oscillation frequencies”.

It goes without saying that this principle is correct. However, its exact meaning is as follows [8]. In a quantized system, the distance ΔE between two neighbouring levels with large quantum numbers differing by unity, i. e. between levels with n and $n + 1$ ($n \gg 1$), is related to the classical frequency ω of this system by relation

$$\Delta E = \hbar\omega. \tag{5}$$

In other words, in the semiclassical case $n \gg 1$, the frequencies corresponding to transitions between energy levels with $\Delta n \ll n$ are integral multiples of the classical frequency ω .

So, contrary to the assumption of Ref. [4], in the discussed problem of a black hole, large quantum numbers n of the correspondence principle are unrelated to the asymptotics (4) of ringing frequencies, but are quantum numbers of the black hole itself. Thus, the belief that the area spacing of a black hole is expressed via asymptotics (4), despite its great popularity, in no way follows from the respectable correspondence principle.

Moreover, this belief is in conflict with simple arguments. The reasoning is as follows. The real part of ringing frequencies does not differ appreciably from its asymptotic value (2) in the whole numerically investigated range of n , starting from $n \sim 1$. Meanwhile the imaginary part grows as $n + 1/2$, and together with it the spectral width of quasinormal modes (in terms of common frequencies) also increases linearly with n . In this situation, the idea that the resolution of a quasinormal mode becomes better and better with the growth of n , and that in the limit $n \rightarrow \infty$ this mode resolves an elementary edge (or site) of a quantized surface, does not look reasonable.

I am grateful to V.F. Dmitriev and V.M. Khatsymovsky for discussions, to L. Smolin for comments in correspondence, and to the anonymous referee for urging to make my criticism more concrete. The investigation was supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research through Grant No. 03-02-17612.

References

- [1] E.W. Leaver, Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A 402 (1985) 285.
- [2] N. Andersson, Class. Quantum Grav. 10 (1993) L61; gr-qc/9602046.
- [3] H.-P. Nollert, Phys. Rev. D 47 (1993) 5253.
- [4] S. Hod, Phys. Rev. Lett. 81 (1998) 4293; gr-qc/98120072.
- [5] L. Motl, Adv. Theor. Math. Phys. 6 (2003) 1135; gr-qc/0212096.
- [6] L. Motl, A. Neitzke, Adv. Theor. Math. Phys. 7 (2003) 307; hep-th/0301173.
- [7] M. Born, *Atomic Physics*, London, Blackie, 1969.
- [8] L.D. Landau, E.M. Lifshitz, *Quantum Mechanics*, London, Pergamon Press, 1958; §48.